

Appendix A10	ISSUES AND RESPONSES TABLE
---------------------	-----------------------------------

ISSUES AND RESPONSES TABLE FOR THE DRAFT SCOPING REPORT

Issues raised by stakeholders during the public participation process thus far are presented in the table below. The issues were extracted from the written submissions made by IAPs during the comment period, as well as notes of the verbal comments made during the focus group meetings conducted as part of the study. The issues raised are categorised for ease of reference as follows (in alphabetical order):

1. Alternatives;
2. Cumulative impacts;
3. Dust (iron ore);
4. Ecological issues;
5. EIA process;
6. General issues;
7. Heritage issues;
8. Marine hydrodynamics;
9. Noise;
10. Planning issues;
11. Risk management;
12. Services & infrastructure;
13. Shipping traffic;
14. Socio-economic issues; and
15. Visual impact.

#	Issue:	Raised by & how:	Comments made:	Responses:
1. ALTERNATIVES				
1.1	General comments	K Samie, DEAT FGM, 24/08/06	All of the proposed alternatives must be feasible, so there shouldn't be a preferred option at this stage.	All three of the alternative stockyard extension locations are feasible and will be assessed on an equal footing in the EIA.
		P. Hardcastle, DEA&DP FGM, 24/08/06	The key potential impact of the proposed upgrade in the context of the Port is pollution. The assessment of alternatives must find the best option.	The assessment by the EIA team of the three stockyard extension alternatives will seek to determine the best technical, socio-economic and environmental options, as well as an overall best option.
1.2	No-go alternative	V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	The no-go alternative also needs to be considered and evaluated.	Agreed, the no-go alternative (no expansion of the iron export capacity) will be assessed in the EIA (please refer to Section 7.4 of the DSR).
1.3	Process alternatives	V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	We would like to advise the applicant at this stage to also include the process alternatives within each of the proposed alternatives in order to address the various issues relating to the proposed activity.	This is noted, please refer to Section 7 of the DSR for information on the alternatives that will be assessed in this EIA.
1.4	Project alternatives	P. Fabricius, West Coast District Municipality FGM, 24/08/06	What about the alternative handling process of direct loading, which would negate the need for some of the dust generating equipment? This option may now be financially viable i.t.o. a 93 mtpa capacity and should be considered in the EIA.	This issue will be addressed in the next phase of the EIA. Currently, stockpile simulation studies are being undertaken to maximise the amount of direct loading and to determine the subsequent number of stockpiles.
		V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	We would like to add the alternative of direct loading of iron ore onto ships. This would eliminate the need to expand the existing iron ore facility. We are aware that the levels of dust have been reduced to levels that are compliant with the health needs of the people. However, stockpiles are potentially one of the greatest contributors of dust pollution. The option of piling iron ore directly onto ships from the trains should be considered.	
1.5	Stockyard extension alternatives	H Steenkamp, Vredenburg Agriculture FGM, 4/09/06	We can't really oppose any of the alternatives; if the engineers say one of the options is the most cost-effective, then we should accept that it is probably the best option.	The assessment of the three stockyard extension alternatives will seek to determine the best technical, socio-economic and environmental options, as well as the overall best option.
		AJ Cannone, Langebaan resident Faxed comment form, 29/08/06	My strongest opposition is to Alternative 1, as this would impact hugely more than the 50 ha mentioned, as a consequence of the access areas as well. Alternative 2 is preferred as it offers no further encroachment into marine areas.	
		P Fabricius, Saldanha Bay Forum Saldanha Bay Forum Meeting, 16/08/06	More emphasis should be placed on the on-shore alternatives for the stockpile extension. The assessment of all the alternatives should be very broad-based.	
		J Wicht, Blouwaterbaai resident Email 30/08/06	We suggest that the extension takes place on land and not into the bay.	
		J Cloete, Vital Connection FGM, 5/09/06	The reason for the three alternatives is because they want to justify the damage that they've already done. They've been doing it piece by piece and now they're doing a big study just so that they don't have to hassle every time. The only reason they want to expand into the sea is so that they can get rid of the dredged material.	
				After discussions with IAPs about the potential impacts of the Phase 1B expansion, Transnet agreed to consolidate the EIAs for further capacity expansions so as to present the public with a holistic perspective of the cumulative impacts of these developments. The Phase 2 expansion EIA was commissioned as a result. The EIA process requires that alternatives be investigated and environmental considerations will influence the chosen alternative. It is acknowledged that disposal of the dredge material is an important consideration - this will be assessed within the next phase of the EIA.

#	Issue:	Raised by & how:	Comments made:	Responses:
		V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	The marine ecosystem is sensitive and Alternative 1 will require that measures are set in place for protection of infrastructure from storms which may require the implementation of new and perhaps untested measures e.g. new breakwater walls. CapeNature is concerned that this alternative will have the greatest long-term impacts.	This concern will be addressed during the specialist studies in the next phase of the EIA. New breakwater walls are not foreseen at this stage.
		DB Strydom, Saldanha resident Comment form, 16/08/06	The reclamation of 50 ha of the Bay would deprive permit-holding fishermen of prime fishing area.	These comments are noted. A specialist study conducted during the EIA for the Phase 1B expansion project found no fish and benthic species in the reclamation dam that do not occur in Saldanha Bay, although other studies have recorded some species that do not typically occur in the region. No endemic species were found in the dam. It was therefore found that reclamation of the dam would not have a significant impact on marine ecology in Saldanha Bay.
		J Cloete, Vital Connection FGM, 5/09/06	It would be a shame to fill in the dam; I'll cry with the fishermen.	
		DB Strydom, Saldanha resident Comment form, 16/08/06	The [reclamation dam] is an asset for the marine life of the Bay. It is a nursery for several species of fish. It is also a source of bait for the local residents and tourists. It will be catastrophic for fishermen if the dam is reclaimed.	It should also be noted that the reclamation dam now forms part of the Phase 1A expansion construction site and, for safety reasons, no fishing is currently permitted.
		G Manuel, Mittal Steel Email, 4/09/06	Our concern is that the dunes form part of the Spreeuwalle dune field and Alternative 2 will lead to the destruction [of] such. It is important that you are informed about various aspects relating to the Spreeuwalle dune field. The largest portion of the Spreeuwalle dune field is situated on Mittal SA land and the rezoning conditions imposed on Saldanha Steel state that this area needs to be set aside for conservation purposes. This condition would also apply to any legal successors in title. The Spreeuwalle dune field is defined as the area between the road and the sea leading from the north of Mykonos to the Port of Saldanha. It is my understanding that Portnet has voluntarily also set aside for conservation purposes a portion of their land, which forms part of the Spreeuwalle area.	This concern is noted. Alternative 2 will only affect a portion of the Spreeuwalle dune field and will not affect the land that Transnet has set aside for conservation purposes (please refer to Section 7.3 of the DSR for a description of the layout alternatives). The potential impact of Alternative 2 on the Spreeuwalle dune field will be assessed in the EIA through vegetation and fauna specialist studies (please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR for information on the proposed specialist studies).
1.6	Water supply alternatives	K Samie, DEAT FGM, 24/08/06	On the issue of water needed for dust mitigation – we recommend that you include and assess the different water supply options in the EIA so that the environmentally acceptable option can be found.	This is noted, thank you. The EIA will investigate several alternative water supply options including the use of recycled or desalinated water (please refer to Section 2.2.1.2 <i>g. General Infrastructure</i>). Discussions with DWAF regarding the supply of water to use in dust mitigation are ongoing. The EIA will also assess alternatives to using water and/or options to reduce the amount of water used.
		V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	Water is a limited resource in most of the Western Cape, but especially along the West Coast, and is under increasing pressure. Currently potable water is used in the process to reduce the effect of dust. Alternative sources of water should be investigated, including the desalination of salt water and recycling of water.	
2. CUMULATIVE IMPACTS				
2.1	Cumulative effects of entire expansion project	M Duckitt, Cape West Coast Biosphere Reserve Fax, 2/09/06	The phased approach to obtaining EIA permissions creates uncertainty in estimating the full cumulative impacts of the intended operation. We see old problems not being addressed on the ground to any real degree of noticeable environmental difference, while the project rumbles on. We do understand macro economic needs. We do not appreciate local provincial and sub regional concerns simply being glossed over.	The issue of addressing cumulative impacts has been recognised. For this reason Transnet agreed to conduct this single EIA covering all planned capacity expansions (called the Phase 2 expansion). A programme is underway to mitigate expected environmental impacts arising from the previous phase capacity expansions and will be expanded to include the new proposed expansions. Transnet has committed itself to international best practice. The relevant specialist studies will assess the fulfilment and effectiveness of the mitigation measures implemented for the previous expansion phases. The mitigation measures will also be continually monitored by Transnet.
		P. Hardcastle, DEA&DP FGM, 24/08/06	A big concern is the incremental way in which the EIAs are being done and the upgrade has taken place. It must be shown clearly how the different ROD conditions are being / have been implemented and what impacts the new proposed upgrade will have, e.g. in terms of dust. The new EIA must show what was done, what the results were and what the actual residual impacts are. Immediate action is needed on what was assessed (and approved) previously before this new EIA is finalised. Best practice techniques should be assessed in terms of the environmental and social context of the Port of Saldanha.	
		K Samie, DEAT FGM, 24/08/06	It is important to include details about the previous EIA applications (ROD conditions, etc.) in the Phase 2 Upgrade EIA so that cumulative issues can be addressed.	
		M Duckitt, Cape West Coast Biosphere Reserve Fax, 2/09/06	The environmental issues on the table are good. They however will need to be looked at holistically and fully consider cumulative effects beyond independent specialist opinion.	
3. DUST (IRON ORE)				
3.1	General comments	J Malherbe, Form Bloodstock Email 2/08/06	One does not have to be a scientist to know that this expansion will result in further air pollution – already a problem under the existing setup.	The concerns regarding dust and the potential health, aesthetic and ecological issues are acknowledged. The EIA will look at current and predicted effects for all alternatives and will also assess alternative technical and management solutions to reduce dust levels. Transnet has indicated a minimum objective to at least reduce the quantity and impacts of dust below current levels, despite the expansion, through improved technology and management.
		J Matthee, Blouwaterbaai homeowner Email 13/08/06	I own a beachfront house at Blouwaterbaai. We are already suffering from pollution as a result of red dust.	
		N Steyn, Botanical Society Fax 31/08/06	The West Coast is a very windy area for most of the year, allowing for a wide distribution of iron ore dust, which discolours and affects both buildings and the indigenous vegetation.	

...continued overleaf

¹ Issues regarding the potential ecological impacts of dust are tabled under 4. Ecological Issues.

#	Issue:	Raised by & how:	Comments made:	Responses:
		J Wicht, Blouwaterbaai resident Email 30/08/06	My house is slightly more protected than the rest of those around here. Over the last two months it has rapidly begun to turn pink and the outer walls are now tainted by unsightly red streaks. That would indicate that dust fall-out is definitely on the increase, despite anything Transnet's monitoring equipment might say.	<p>Furthermore, Transnet has committed itself to following international best practice. An Australian team with experience in dust mitigation has been contracted to assist Transnet. Transnet's environmental performance is monitored through an EMC as is required by the RoDs for Phases 1A and 1B. A special dust committee has access to raw dust monitoring data and has had several meetings with the dust monitoring specialist. Transnet has also made measurements of the dust emissions from the harbour available through the EMC and at meetings with Blouwaterbaai residents.</p> <p>The CSIR's modelling of dust emissions also display clear patterns which are now being verified through recently installed, new monitors. If interested, IAPs could attend the next meeting at which the dust emission data will be presented. There is, however, a need for an objectively verifiable means of measuring dust fall-out. The best known way of doing this is by means of the existing state-of-the-art monitors installed by the CSIR. Any suggestions as to how this may be improved are welcome.</p> <p>Transnet undertook to reduce dust emissions from the harbour after several meetings with Blouwaterbaai residents and a comprehensive dust mitigation project is currently being implemented. An interim amount of R100 million has been set aside for this purpose. Transnet has also agreed to a once-off repainting of all affected houses once these dust mitigation measures have been put in place.</p> <p>The efficiency of the Phase 1B expansion mitigation measures will be apparent prior to the completion of, and will be taken account of during the Phase 2 EIA.</p>
		G van Zyl, West Coast Business Development Centre / Afrikaanse Sakekamer FGM, 4/09/06	It is interesting that Blouwaterbaai does not lie in the direction that the predominant winds blow. It probably is just a case of dust hanging in the air and settling in a certain radius around the terminal – Blouwaterbaai just happens to be the closest residential area. Also, for me personally, the dust is an eyesore and if discolours everything, even your car when you drive past the harbour.	
		E Steyn, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Councillor FGM, 4/09/06	People complain about iron ore dust and promises are regularly made that something will be done, but nothing ever happens. Houses have to be repainted every 2/3 years – it can't be washed off because it gets stained. It also discolours clothes and cars, even parking areas where cars are parked that drive through the area. You can't wash it off either, it stains.	
		C van der Berg, Langebaan Ratepayers and Residents Association Faxed comment form, 1/09/06	One of our greatest concerns is iron ore dust pollution – air and land.	
		I Bester, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	We can't trust reports published by large corporations on their pollution performance; there is a perception that they can and do manipulate data to make them look good. They bury negative data in reporting that is difficult to interpret.	
		J Cloete, Vital Connection FGM, 5/09/06	Iron ore dust is everywhere – if you drive through the area you're red by the time you get home.	
		N Steyn, Botanical Society Fax 31/08/06	The additional stockpile areas can only cause a marked increase in iron dust pollution to everyone and everything in the entire Saldanha Bay and Langebaan Lagoon area.	
		A Hein, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Councillor FGM, 5/09/06	The problem is not the iron ore facility – it's there already. The problem is dust and how it will be controlled.	
		J Cillie, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Councillor FGM, 5/09/06	The problem is that the process that is used at Saldanha is completely out of date. In other places in the world they use clean processes where there is no dust in the environment. It's only that Transnet does not want to carry the costs.	
		M Duckitt, Cape West Coast Biosphere Reserve Fax, 2/09/06	Your document alludes to global best practice design standards. It sounds great but does it address the consequence of iron ore dust becoming the dominant colour of much downwind of the Port. Surely we should be seen to be addressing existing concerns, or are they all mitigated to DEAT's satisfaction?	
		H Steenkamp, Vredenburg Agriculture FGM, 4/09/06	People complaining about the dust staining their houses must remember that the iron ore terminal was here long before they built their houses nearby.	
		M Halvorsen, Cape West Coast Biosphere Reserve Emailed letter, 1/09/06	When will the current pollution problem (dust) be solved? Should this not be done before a new process is started?	
		G Clemitson, Saldanha Bay Trading cc FGM, 5/09/06	We talk about Transnet but it is not their iron ore; they just operate the export facility. They have put measures in place to control dust but it is not adequate. Now we must consider the consequences of three times more dust.	
		G Clemitson, Saldanha Bay Trading cc FGM, 5/09/06	Iron ore dust is limiting the industrial/commercial potential of the harbour. Fruit packed at Saldanha was rejected by the European market because of dust. Capespan informed us in writing that they will never come back to Saldanha until the dust is controlled. We're closer to the fruit producing areas than Cape Town is!	
		G Clemitson, Saldanha Bay Trading cc FGM, 5/09/06	Watering doesn't work – they don't want to put water in the ships because they want to maximise the tonnage that is exported.	
		G Clemitson, Saldanha Bay Trading cc FGM, 5/09/06	In Australia there are new ports where the stockpile area are completely under cover and the conveyor system runs under the port to the ships. Why can't Kumba do the same?	
			The social, economic and air quality specialist studies will address this issue and determine the potential benefits associated with significant reductions in dust levels (please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR for information on the proposed specialist studies). It is the intention of Transnet to control the dust levels to within acceptable limits.	
			A iron ore export client quality requirement includes a maximum limit of moisture content in the iron ore; this dictates the amount of water that can be utilised in dust mitigation.	
			The effectiveness of covering stockpiles and conveyors will be assessed both in the air quality specialist studies and engineering studies undertaken during the EIA Phase (please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR for information on the proposed specialist studies).	

#	Issue:	Raised by & how:	Comments made:	Responses:
3.2	Health issues	J Wicht, Blouwaterbaai resident Email 30/08/06	Lately I've noticed a burning sensation in my eyes and I wonder of the two are not linked.	These comments are noted, thank you. A specialist air quality and health impact assessment will be conducted as part of the EIA and will include a consideration of the effect of dust on people's health (please refer to Section 6.2 of the DSR). The South African legislated limits will be used as a minimum guideline.
		A Wicht, Blue Bay Lodge Faxed comment form 31/08/06	Our concern is dust pollution and the potential health risks it has for individuals, which will already double with the Phase 1A and 1B upgrades. No satisfying research has been done or any solutions found for these aspects. We therefore require a guarantee that acceptable limits will be set for the Phase 2 upgrade.	
		E Steyn, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Councillor FGM, 4/09/06	Houses can be repainted but what about the health aspects? People complain of bronchial problems like asthma and sinus problems. People complain about these things especially when it is windy. Dust travels all the way to the koppie at Vredenburg. I can't see how they will ever be able to control it.	
		I Bester, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	I've never had hay fever problems before but I've been getting it since the iron ore harbour has been here.	
		I Bester, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	There has been a huge increase in asthma and sinus problems and the perception is definitely that it is as result of the iron ore dust.	
		J van Litzendorgh, SAPS Vredenburg FGM, 4/09/06	Do you know what the health impact of iron ore is?	
		C van der Berg, Langebaan Ratepayers and Residents Association Faxed comment form, 1/09/06	We recommend that an epidemiological study is done to determine the impact of a direct or indirect increase in iron ore dust on human health.	
		A Hein, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Councillor FGM, 5/09/06	You can't tell me that the dust does not have a health impact!	
3.3	Mitigation	I Bester, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Council Comment form, 17/08/06	Concerned about the impact of the red iron ore dust; we request that you cover the conveyor belts as well as the ship loading and stockpile areas.	The covering of conveyors and other potential sources of iron ore dust emissions are some of the process/technological options that will be assessed in the EIA in terms of feasibility, cost and effectiveness.
		C van der Berg, Langebaan Ratepayers and Residents Association Faxed comment form, 1/09/06	Please inform us of the toxicity, concentration and pollution potential of the proposed chemical additives to be used in the mitigation of dust impacts.	The requested information will be provided in the EIA Report.
3.4	Property prices	K Blaauw, Cape Global FGM, 4/09/06	I'm sure estate agents would say that the iron ore dust affects property prices in the Saldanha area.	This is noted, thank you and will be addressed as part of the economic specialist study.
4. ECOLOGICAL ISSUES				
4.1	General comments	V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	The Saldanha Peninsula forms part of the West Coast Biosphere Reserve and, together with the Langebaan and its surrounding islands, forms an area of international ecological importance. Thus it is imperative that this special ecological system functions in a viable way. The threatened nature of the habitat calls for integrated management of the marine and terrestrial environment, as it is an active system. The upgrading of the port will impact on this ecological system in various ways.	This is noted, thank you. The EIA will incorporate the findings of various specialist studies that will assess the potential impact of the proposed expansion on biodiversity and ecology, including vegetation, avian and terrestrial fauna, marine and benthic ecology, etc. (please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR for information on the proposed specialist studies).
		J Wicht, Blouwaterbaai resident Email 30/08/06	Another problem I have with the project in general is that of the thousands of tons of Gracillaria rotting on the beach, particularly how this was not taken into consideration when the ore harbour was first proposed.	
4.2	Avifauna	K Harrison, West Coast Bird Club Email 18/08/06	The area is either in or adjoins the West Coast National Park and Saldanha Bay Islands IBA (Important Bird Area) SA 105. There are CWAC and BIRP results available for the area at the ADU. The Percy FitzPatrick Institute also conducted several years of study on the African Black Oystercatcher around the Ore Harbour. The area is in the flight path of the species that use the islands as night roosting sites, e.g. African Sacred Ibises and Cape Gulls who feed in St. Helena Bay and commute each night and morning. Other species most likely also use the route at night.	Thank you for this information. A specialist study on the potential impact of the proposed expansion on avifauna will be conducted as part of the EIA and this information will be provided to the relevant specialist (please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR for information on the proposed specialist studies).
4.3	Botany	K Harrison, West Coast Bird Club Email 18/08/06	A new flower species has developed in the dune area – Deon van Eeden, the chairman of the local Botanical Society, will have details.	Thank you for this information. A specialist study on the potential impact of the proposed expansion on vegetation will be conducted as part of the EIA and this information will be provided to the relevant specialist (please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR for information on the proposed specialist studies).

#	Issue:	Raised by & how:	Comments made:	Responses:
4.4	Botany – Impact of dust	G van Zyl, West Coast Business Development Centre / Afrikaanse Sakekamer FGM, 4/09/06	Dust is not just an issue for the people of Blouwaterbaai, it also impacts on the veld surrounding the harbour.	Please see the response in 4.3 above.
		V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	An investigation should be done to determine the impacts and the effect of ore dust on plant life. (It was noted on site by Barrie Low that the plant <i>Othonna coronopifolia</i> , known to be a perennial, could have adapted to the dust by becoming deciduous.)	
		E Steyn, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	It is not only the impact on people but also impact on the surrounding veld – look at the area around the iron ore harbour! There used to be lots of flowers and now there's nothing.	
		J Cillie, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Councillor FGM, 5/09/06	Iron ore dust also has an impact on nature – no animal can eat the plants around the terminal. And all the flowers are gone. There are also less buck, tortoises and snakes than before.	
4.5	Dune system	V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	The dune system is endemic to the Saldanha Peninsula, and the local and regional impact of the proposed development will be high. It is essential that a biodiversity assessment be undertaken to inform the proposal so as to ensure that the biodiversity value of the area is not compromised. This impact could be offset if neighbouring properties are secured for conservation purposes.	These comments are noted. Specialist studies that will be conducted as part of the EIA include several investigations into the potential impact of the proposal on biodiversity aspects, including botany, terrestrial fauna, avifauna and any other relevant issues that arise from the scoping process. This will also include an assessment of the potential impacts on the dune system (please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR for information on the proposed specialist studies).
		J Cloete, Vital Connection FGM, 5/09/06	What will the impact be on the dunes behind the dam? There are large dunes that definitely have an ecological function in terms of erosions, etc.	
4.6	Fauna	V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	A study of the faunal population assemblages in the area should be undertaken to determine potential impacts. Potentially there are various reptiles and amphibians found in the region, particularly in the area adjacent to the reclamation dam, i.e. coastal rainfrog (<i>Breviceps macrops</i>), the legless lizard, black girdled lizard (<i>Cordylus niger</i>), the angulate tortoise (<i>Chresina angulata</i>), southern dwarf adder (<i>Bitis armata</i>). It is known that the golden mole (<i>Eremitalpa granti</i>) occurs along a restricted range up to Lambert's Bay and is should be investigated to see if its range extends to this region. Other mammals, viz. honey badger (<i>Mellivora capensis</i>) and the African striped weasel (<i>Poecilogale albunucha</i>) could potentially also be found in this area.	Thank you for this information. A specialist study on the potential impact of the proposed expansion on terrestrial fauna will be conducted as part of the EIA and this information will be provided to the relevant specialist (please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR for information on the proposed specialist studies).
4.7	Marine ecology – Impact of blasting	M Nell, WPVV Saldanha FGM, 5/09/06	As soon as you do any blasting in the marine environment, all of the fish disappear.	This comment is noted. The potential impacts of blasting will be assessed as part of the EIA. Please refer to Section 2.2 of the DSR for more information about possible blasting requirements.
4.8	Marine ecology – Impact of dredging	J Cloete, Vital Connection FGM, 5/09/06	Perlemoen used to be abundant along the causeway (big bay side), but not any longer. The bay is also much shallower than it used to be. Dredging will be a big tragedy.	These comments are noted. The potential impacts of dredging will be assessed as part of the EIA. Please refer to Section 2.2.1.2 of the DSR for more information on the proposed dredging activities
		V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	How frequently will dredging take place and where will this material be dumped? Will this material be used for other purposes and if so what? We recommend that the effect of dredging on benthic ecosystems be investigated.	
4.9	Marine ecology – Impact of dust	K Harrison, West Coast Bird Club Email 18/08/06	What is the link between iron ore dust and algal blooms? Dr. Tony Williams at the ADU may have information.	This comment is noted. A benthic and marine ecology specialist assessment will be conducted as part of the EIA (please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR for information on the proposed specialist studies) and this question will be passed on to the relevant specialist
		V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	What are the effects of ore run-off on ground water? Is this run-off associated with the algal blooms in the area, i.e. pollution into the sea? A similar strategy to, say petrol stations, could be implemented to prevent the contaminated surface water from leaking into the groundwater system.	
		A Kruger, Saldanha Bay & Langebaan Tourism Saldanha Bay Forum Meeting, 16/08/06	The dust issue is most important. What is being done to identify and address the impact of dust on the marine environment?	
4.10	Marine ecology – Impact of run-off	V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	Another concern is pollution of the marine ecosystem as a result of drainage, storm water and iron ore dust. We recommend a geophysicist be appointed to inform on this aspect.	These comments are noted. A specialist study on the potential impact of the proposed expansion on groundwater and the marine environment, including potential pollutants, will be conducted as part of the EIA (please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR for information on the proposed specialist studies). The IWWMP would aim to prevent pollution (of groundwater, the marine ecosystem, etc.) as a result of wastewater and contaminated stormwater.
4.11	Marine ecology – Shipping traffic	C van der Berg, Langebaan Ratepayers and Residents Association Faxed comment form, 1/09/06	One of our greatest concerns is seawater pollution, specifically the disposal of ship ballast water and the leaking of bunker oil into the bay.	Specialist studies to assess the potential impact of ballast water discharge at the iron ore terminal will be conducted as part of this EIA. In addition, an Incremental Shipping Risk Study will be conducted, which will identify and seek to mitigate oil spill risk as a result of the proposed expansion project.

#	Issue:	Raised by & how:	Comments made:	Responses:
5. EIA PROCESS				
5.1	General comments	J Cillie, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Councillor FGM, 5/09/06	People are not heard in these studies. We're not concerned that the consultants will not do a good job, but we want to make sure that the people are heard.	A comprehensive public consultation process, including public open days and focus group meetings, is being conducted as part of this EIA process. The notes of all meetings held, and all written comments submitted by Interested & Affected Parties (IAPs) will be incorporated into the EIA documentation and will be submitted to the authorities for consideration in decision-making. These comments are noted, thank you. Transnet has contracted the CSIR to develop a new nuisance dust limit for the iron ore terminal with the aim of markedly reducing the risk of impacts on neighbouring port activities.
		G Clemitson, Saldanha Bay Trading cc FGM, 5/09/06	Minister Erwin has said that Saldanha will have a new container terminal in 5 years' time to accommodate the new draft carrier ships that can't go the Cape Town. Therefore lots of development will happen in a short tie in 'small bay' but they have restricted space there. They can only go back into land but the port wants to go into the sea. We have to look at all sides; we don't want to chase away commercial ventures because this will bring jobs. It's a very intense time for Saldanha and we must make sure that we are appropriately prepared.	
		H Steenkamp, Vredenburg Agriculture FGM, 4/09/06	You can't resist development, but it should happen properly. Pollution is already a problem in the bay because of all the industrial development.	
		W Arendse, Saldanha resident FGM, 5/09/06	We must ensure that Saldanha does not become a harbour that handles the country's waste products.	
5.2	General comments – EMC	M Duckitt, Cape West Coast Biosphere Reserve Fax, 2/09/06	The project must incorporate CBO and NGO input to reflect community concerns in any monitoring processes, which should at least reflect a 50% west coast representation in its compilation. Somehow this is our back yard and is best dealt with by competent local inputs into its management. One simply has a different focus if your children are not to live here.	These comments are noted. Monitoring will be the subject of an Environmental Management Plan (EMP) which will be compiled once the EIA for the proposed Phase 2 expansion has been completed. The EMP will incorporate all of the key recommendations from the EIA and will address the establishment and membership of an Environmental Management Committee (EMC), which will be tasked with monitoring the implementation of the EMP. These comments are noted. Please note that the Port's existing EMC for the Phase 1A expansion project has recently been replaced with a new EMC for the Phase 1B expansion project. All outstanding matters for Phase 1A will be dealt with by the new EMC. An inaugural meeting of the EMC for Phase 1B was held on 20 September 2006 and the chairperson has been selected as Prof Jan Giliomee. The EMC members for Phase 1B have not been finalised, but the West Coast Biosphere Reserve has been invited to join.
		M Duckitt, Cape West Coast Biosphere Reserve Fax, 2/09/06	Questions as to membership of the existing Port Development's Environmental monitoring committee drew a non response with promise of we will advise! We are still waiting! (RE CWCBR attendees SCWalsh & MEHalvorsen questions) Requests for us to access and interrogate the work records of this EMC similarly are still awaited!	
5.3	EIA Regulations	M Spocter Email 17/08/06	The EIA is being conducted i.t.o. the ECA (Act 73 of 1989) – should the development not be assessed i.t.o. the new NEMA Environmental Regulations that were enacted on 1 July 2006?	The EIA Application Form for the proposed Phase 2 expansion project was submitted to DEAT in May 2006 when the ECA was still in force. DEAT is obligated to consider the application i.t.o. the regulations in force at the time of this submission, in other words, the ECA Regulations. Yes; the appeal process will be conducted according to the legislation in terms of which the EIA is considered. The NEMA Regulations allow for such transitional cases for which a holistic assessment is required. Cognisance will be therefore be taken of the requirements of the NEMA Regulations and the potential impacts of any such activities will be assessed. All activities listed in terms of ECA and NEMA must be identified during scoping and the public given an opportunity to raise their comments and concerns about these activities. The main difference between the ECA and the NEMA EIA Regulations is that the NEMA Regulations distinguishes between two types of projects; smaller projects with relatively inconsequential impacts for which a Basic Assessment is required, and larger, potentially more harmful projects for which a Scoping Study as well as an Impact Assessment is required.
		W. Silbernagl, PGWC: Roads FGM, 24/08/06	Will the appeal process also be conducted i.t.o. the ECA?	
		A. Matoti, DEA&DP FGM, 24/08/06	What about activities listed i.t.o. the NEMA Regulations but not in terms of ECA Regulations? Will authorisation in terms of NEMA be applied for these activities?	
		C van der Berg, Langebaan Ratepayers and Residents Association Faxed comment form, 1/09/06	Since the EIA will be conducted in terms of the "old" EIA regulations and not the "new" regulations that came into force on 3 July 2006, we would like to recommend that the stricter of the two in terms of NEMA is applied.	
		M Halvorsen, Cape West Coast Biosphere Reserve Emailed letter, 1/09/06	Why the decision to take part in the EIA process under the "old" regulations? Why not the "new" regulations?	
		J Kotze, Saldanha Bay & Langebaan Tourism Saldanha Bay Forum Meeting, 16/08/06	What is the difference between the "old" and the "new" EIA Regulations?	
5.4	Enforcement of recommendations	AJ Cannone, Langebaan resident Faxed comment form, 29/08/06	My concern is the extent to which an EIA outcome can be prescriptive and conditional. Although the BID states that Transnet "plans to minimise environmental impacts by implementing the following equipment", the water spray systems and other strategies to minimise dust levels MUST be an enforceable pre-condition for further development. As part of your feedback process I would be grateful to be informed of legally enforceable safeguards that could/would ensure compliance on the part of Transnet.	DEAT takes into account the findings of the EIA and specifically the proposed mitigation measures when drawing up their Record of Decision (ROD) and the conditions of authorisation (if granted). The ROD and the conditions of authorisation are legally enforceable and a proponent may be prosecuted (by DEAT) if these conditions are not complied with.

#	Issue:	Raised by & how:	Comments made:	Responses:
		J Cillie, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Councillor FGM, 5/09/06	My concern is that a good EIA is done with good recommendations that are taken into account by Environmental Affairs, but then there is no policing. Previously it was said that dust will not have an impact. How do we know that the mitigation measures proposed will work? There may be a very good theoretical measure but it may not work in practice, e.g. what would happen if in 5 years' time it becomes apparent that the ROD conditions were not complied with? Will the government do something about it since the project has implications for the country's economy?	An EMC is in place and is tasked with ensuring that the ROD conditions of approval are complied with. Any non-compliance should be reported to the authorities. Phase 1A mitigation is to be evaluated as part of specialist studies in the EIA phase. The CAPCO permit requires dust to be monitored and results reported to DEAT. The new EMC for phase 1B as well as any future EMC for Phase 2 will be as independent as possible and have active community participation.
5.5	Independence of consultants	J Cillie, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Councillor FGM, 5/09/06	I am worried by the fact that the proponents appoint the consultants that do the EIA. It's just logical that, if the company doesn't like what the consultants say, they would not appoint them again.	This is noted, however, the proponent is required by law to appoint the EIA consultants. In addition, the EIA consultants are required by law to act independently and to be objective in their conduct at all times. All information produced, including specialist studies, are made available for public scrutiny and, in some cases, are reviewed by an independent third party to ensure high standards of work and independence.
5.6	Information disclosure	A Carnegie, WESSA Western Cape Saldanha Bay Forum Meeting, 16/08/06	Information on the location(s) of new dredging channels should be indicated in the BID. The [EIA] process should have been held back until such time as all information is clear and available.	This information was made available to Mr Carnegie at his request and is included in the DSR.
		A Carnegie, Saldanha resident Faxed comment form, 17/08/06	It was a great disappointment that no General Layout Plans, showing the provisional locations of the two shipping berths, the access channels and the possible reclamation areas, were on display at the open days. It is not possible for the Saldanha public to make meaningful comment without this information. We are well aware that there is a plan and it should not be withheld from the public. I suggest that an addendum to the BID be circulated that includes the provisional layout plan and the current rationale for adopting whatever configuration is being currently adopted.	
5.7	Peer review	M Duckitt, Cape West Coast Biosphere Reserve Fax, 2/09/06	The fact that the EIA is to be evaluated by DEAT, who surely cannot be construed as independent, is scary. We request peer review against best global practice as your document suggests, that also take fully on board local and Cape Provincial concerns. Monitoring against known as finite standards by independent auditors comprises the single largest fatal flaw in this process, as in most EIA processes.	This is noted. DEAT is the government department responsible for evaluating projects of national importance and for issuing environmental authorisation in terms of the relevant legislation. Key studies conducted as part of the EIA will also be peer reviewed – please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR.
5.8	Stakeholders	C van der Berg, Langebaan Ratepayers and Residents Association Faxed comment form, 1/09/06	Please add the Provincial Department of Health and Department of Environmental Affairs and Development Planning to the list of relevant authorities in the BID. Please add the Langebaan Ratepayers Association to the list of local NGOs and CBOs in the BID.	These stakeholders have been added to the database of IAPs for this projects (see Appendix A2 – please note that the list of key stakeholders provided in the BID is not exhaustive and intended only to provide an indication of the stakeholders that will be consulted during the process. Please refer to the DSR Appendix A2 for a list of all IAPs that have been and will be consulted during the EIA process. All IAPs are invited to participate in the process by attending meetings and submitting written comments which are incorporated into the study.
		M Halvorsen, Cape West Coast Biosphere Reserve Emailed letter, 1/09/06	How will West Coast environmental bodies be included in current and future processes and environmental management? The facility is located in the Cape West Coast Biosphere Reserve where sustainable development is and should be the norm.	
6.	GENERAL ISSUES			
6.1	Additional breakwaters	G Clemitson, Saldanha Bay Trading cc FGM, 5/09/06	The iron ore terminal has to be into the bay because it has to receive the carrier ships. And the ships will have to be protected – they will have to build breakwaters.	At this stage, no additional breakwaters are required. The current protective measures for the bay are believed to be sufficient for Phase 2.
6.2	Beaches	A Kruger, Saldanha Bay & Langebaan Tourism Saldanha Bay Forum Meeting, 16/08/06	Beaches should be cleaned on a daily basis.	This is noted – the cleaning of beaches is the responsibility of the local municipality.
6.3	Biodiversity offsets	V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	Since it is possible that the overall societal welfare could increase from a development such as this, the idea of biodiversity offsets was discussed. The coastal strip of undeveloped land from the harbour extending towards the town of Langebaan was identified as a suitable site that could be used as an offset to mitigate the residual impact of the proposed development. CapeNature would, however, like to emphasise that the inclusion of an offset proposal in the EIA does not eliminate the requirement to follow the hierarchy of “avoid, minimise, mitigate”. It is not a short cut to development approval. The DEA&DP guidelines on biodiversity offsets must be adhered to in this regard.	This is noted. As discussed during the Focus Group Meeting held on 24 August 2006, the biodiversity offset relating to the Spreeuwalle area that is being investigated by Transnet is a separate issue from the EIA and will not be included in the study. In other words, the proposed offset will not be considered a mitigation measure for the potential impacts of the proposal on biodiversity and the normal hierarchy of “avoid, minimise, mitigate” will be implemented.
6.4	Blasting	N Steyn, Botanical Society Fax 31/08/06	Blasting operations will cause damage to houses and other buildings, particularly in the Saldanha Bay and Langebaan Lagoon areas.	This comment is noted. The potential impacts of blasting will be assessed as part of the EIA. Please refer to Section 2.2 of the DSR for more information about possible blasting requirements.

#	Issue:	Raised by & how:	Comments made:	Responses:
6.5	Inland harbour	W Eksteen, BBBEE Forum FGM, 5/09/06	The suggestion of an inland harbour has been stopped in principle by Transnet when they built their offices at the proposed inlet to the inland harbour. Now they have to dredge etc. because they have already decided that that is where the berths must go.	This study deals with the proposed expansion of the iron ore handling facility only and issues regarding the port as a whole therefore fall outside of the scope of the EIA. However, information on the conceptual plans for the port's development is provided in Section 4.3 of the DSR.
		W Arendse, White City / Diazville community leader FGM, 5/09/06	The inland harbour proposal makes much more sense!	
6.6	Local communities	M Halvorsen, Cape West Coast Biosphere Reserve Emailed letter, 1/09/06	What further impacts will there be on the current communities around the bay?	Specialist social and economic impact assessments will be conducted as part of the EIA, which will identify and assess the potential impacts of the proposed expansion on the local communities (please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR for information on the proposed specialist studies).
6.7	No development zone	H Steenkamp, Vredenburg Agriculture FGM, 4/09/06	I think Transnet should buy and maintain a no-development zone around the entire Port. There will always be pollution where there is development and industry; as long as the employees and the immediate environment is protected to some extent.	This suggestion is noted. Mitigation measures will be identified during the EIA to ensure that pollution is limited and that any impacts are kept to within acceptable limits.
6.8	Oil pipeline	V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	Any impacts associated with the realignment of the existing petrol/oil pipeline will also need to be considered.	The realignment of the existing oil pipeline will be addressed in the EIA (please refer to Section 2.2 of the DSR).
6.9	Opposition to the project	J Malherbe, Form Bloodstock Email 2/08/06	We will be bringing an interdict against further development.	This is noted.
		M. Rothenburg, Blouwaterbaai resident Emails, 8&22/08/06	Phase 1B is still under consideration and commencing the EIA for Phase 2 is premature. Our agreement to Phase 1B should be withdrawn as it seems that Transnet has no intention of sticking to its agreements, inter alia, that a new monitoring committee would be set up and that a comprehensive EIA would be conducted before any further increases in export capacity. The Phase 2 EIA should be postponed to at least a year from now to enable adequate data on dust pollution to be collected, taking into account the mitigation measures proposed under 1B. Under the circumstances I oppose any further extensions to the iron ore export capacity.	A new EMC has been set up as per the Phase 1B ROD conditions – the inaugural meeting was held on 20 September 2006 and the chairperson has been selected as Prof Jan Giliomee. This Phase 2 EIA is being conducted in response to the requirement for a comprehensive EIA of all further planned expansion phases.
		N Steyn, Botanical Society Fax 31/08/06	The proposed Phase 2 upgrade will be extremely harmful to the environment and will not be in the public interest.	The EIA process is being conducted in order to assess the potential impacts on the environment and identify appropriate mitigation. It will also enable Saldanha Bay residents to assess whether the development is in the public interest or not.
6.10	Public access	DB Strydom, Saldanha resident Comment form, 16/08/06	Please try to make provision (with a road) for access to Spreeuwalle (the beach east of the Dam) for the public and fishermen.	The Spreeuwalle area has high conservation value and any development of this area has to be subject to a proper management plan for the area. Transnet will consider this issue.
6.11	Public opinion on Transnet	E Steyn, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	Transnet has a very bad image in the area. For example, look at their property at the entrance to Vredenburg- the dilapidated station building; it used to win prizes for its garden etc. We managed to stop it from being demolished but now we can't do anything to improve it and we have to fight every year to get Transnet to keep the place clean. It creates a very bad impression when you enter Vredenburg. Transnet should contribute to the community, like Sasol's plans to build a school for the community.	Transnet understands that trust can only be built over a long period of time and have committed themselves to a long-term collaborative process with the public. This is reflected by the way in which they have dealt with the establishment of the new EMC for the Phase 1B expansion project. Transnet realises that change tends to be difficult, but is optimistic that it is possible to establish a mutually beneficial relationship with the local communities in which it operates. The issue regarding the station-building in Vredenburg has been referred to the appropriate party in Transnet and a response is awaited. The removal of washed-up kelp from beaches, however, is a municipal responsibility.
		I Bester, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	The community never had a problem with Iscor. Iscor built houses for its workers etc. When Transnet took over they removed Iscor's workers and it almost became a ghost town. Since then, Transnet has had a very bad image among the local community.	
		E Steyn, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	There is always an impact and we don't expect that no development takes place, but Transnet must definitely show more community involvement.	
		J Cloete, Vital Connection FGM, 5/09/06	Transnet means nothing to me; they may mean a few rand for the country's coffers but I doubt even that. There is much dishonesty going on. They know exactly what's going on, but they don't do anything. And they don't listen – we say the same things every time (e.g. don't go into the sea), but they don't listen.	
		J Cloete, Vital Connection FGM, 5/09/06	We are sceptical about how things are done and the promises that are made. We live here, our lives are here, we raise our children here. There used to be a 3 km long beach for our children, and now? Kelp is washed onto the beach and lie there rotting. Nobody does anything about it, especially not the roleplayers with the big buck. It's not just an issue of transparency, it's that we don't trust them; they lie to us.	
W Arendse, White City / Diazville community leader FGM, 5/09/06	There is a stigma – the old Portnet was seen as cold and unfriendly. They were not friendly to the people and they were conservative. Maria Ramos is a great woman but many people don't like women at the top. There is a social history that may be difficult to change.			

#	Issue:	Raised by & how:	Comments made:	Responses:
6.12	Rail upgrades	V Bowie, CapeNature FGM, 24/08/06	What about the railway line?	The Sishen-Saldanha railway line will also be upgraded by extending the loops to allow longer trains to use the line. A separate EIA process is being undertaken for the railway line upgrade. Upgrades to the Salkor yard, and the shunting lines between there and the Port, will form part of the Phase 2 expansion EIA.
		H Steenkamp, Vredenburg Agriculture FGM, 4/09/06	The Sishen-Saldanha railway line crosses my land and I hear they are proposing to upgrade this as well. We've never had problems with pollution along the railway line.	
6.13	RAMSAR	N Steyn, Botanical Society Fax 31/08/06	Oil and increased iron ore dust pollution could severely impact on South Africa's obligations as a founding member of the RAMSAR Convention, with the Langebaan Lagoon and the five islands having been registered as one of South Africa's first wetland sites of international importance. It is has not already been done, the RAMSAR Convention headquarters in Gland, Switzerland, should urgently be informed of the proposed Phase 2 Expansion by the South African Government and be invited to comment, as a possible key stakeholder.	This is noted. The RAMSAR Convention headquarters is listed on the IAP database and were sent a copy of the BID.
		V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	The Langebaan Lagoon system is a RAMSAR site and is also under obligation to the African Eurasian Water Bird Agreement. The impacts of the proposal on these, and any other international agreements must be investigated.	This comment is noted and will be passed on to the relevant biodiversity specialists. (please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR for information on the proposed specialist studies).
6.14	Reclamation	V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	Where will the fill material come from for reclamation and what are the associated impacts with the retrieval of the fill material?	Dredging is required to deepen the shipping channels to the proposed new berths and the dredged material will be used as fill material, if required. The potential impact of dredging will be addressed in the EIA.
6.15	Support for the project	E Genis, Langebaan resident Comment form, 15/08/06	Go ahead in a disciplined way. We need the development.	This is noted.
		W Duiker, Strategic HR Services Faxed comment form, 29/08/06	The West Coast is suitable for industrial growth and long term import and export. Statistics have shown that the people of the West Coast welcome an iron ore facility at the Port. As a BEE company we welcome and support the proposed Phase 2 upgrade.	This is noted.
6.16	Terminal lengthening	J Cillie, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Councillor FGM, 5/09/06	What about the planned lengthening of the terminal?	There are no plans to lengthen the iron ore terminal at this stage; the new iron ore berths are planned to be constructed along the existing causeway.
6.17	Water	G van Zyl, West Coast Business Development Centre / Afrikaanse Sakekamer FGM, 4/09/06	Historically the lack of water in the Saldanha area has limited development and ensured that it didn't become like Table Bay.	This is noted. Water may be needed, <i>inter alia</i> to use in dust suppression systems, and several alternative water supply options will be assess in the EIA (please refer to Section 2.2 of the DSR).
		H Steenkamp, Vredenburg Agriculture FGM, 4/09/06	Lack of water has definitely been the limiting factor for development of the West Coast – people will have to start desalinating seawater for water supply.	
7.	HERITAGE ISSUES			
7.1	Maritime archaeology	Dr B Werz Email, 16/08/06	The EIA should include specialist input with regards to Maritime Archaeology because of the possible reclamation of 50 ha of the bay area.	The potential impact on Maritime Archaeology will be assessed in the EIA as part of the Heritage Impact Assessment specialist study.
7.2	Terrestrial archaeology	K Harrison, West Coast Bird Club Email 18/08/06	Preserving the evidence of early human habitation in the dune area is important – a contact would be Pippa Haarhoff at the West Coast Fossil Park.	The potential impact on terrestrial archaeology will also be assessed as part of the Heritage Impact Assessment specialist study. Ms Haarhoff is on the IAP database and has been provided with the BID for this project.
8.	MARINE HYDRODYNAMICS			
8.1	General comments	A Kruger, Saldanha Bay & Langebaan Tourism Saldanha Bay Forum Meeting, 16/08/06	A study should be done to determine, identify and assess the impacts of deepening of the shipping channels on the entire bay.	A comprehensive marine hydrodynamics study is being conducted by the CSIR as part of the EIA. This study will investigate the potential impacts of the proposed expansion and the three layout alternatives, including dredging on blasting, on the marine environment and will include studies on water quality, shoreline stability (beach erosion) and shipping risks (please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR for information on the proposed specialist studies).
		V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	What will be the effects on the currents in the bay in general and of the flow regime into the lagoon system?	
		S Brown, Southern Sea Fishing Saldanha Bay Forum Meeting, 16/08/06	Circulation in small bay seems to be less than before – sediments and pollution appear to remain in the bay much longer. This issue needs to be looked at in the EIA studies.	
		M Halvorsen, Cape West Coast Biosphere Reserve Emailed letter, 1/09/06	Further change to the seafloor through dredging is mentioned but not discussed in detail. How will ocean currents change? Will Transnet accept responsibility for current and future damage?	
		J Cloete, Vital Connection FGM, 5/09/06	What study has been done on ocean currents in terms of erosion problems, the beaches of Saldanha and all the kelp that washes up on the beaches?	
		C van Wyk, Saldanha Bay Water Quality Trust Saldanha Bay Forum Meeting, 16/08/06	The study should look at more than just the port, and should include the Langebaan Lagoon.	
8.2	Beach erosion	K Harrison, West Coast Bird Club Email 18/08/06	By how much have sea levels risen over the past 10, 20, 50 years? This will affect future beach erosion.	Sea level rise issues will be considered in the marine hydrodynamics specialist study (see responses to 8.1 above).

#	Issue:	Raised by & how:	Comments made:	Responses:
		C van der Berg, Langebaan Ratepayers and Residents Association Faxed comment form, 1/09/06	The deepening of the shipping channels and 12 million m ³ of dredged material will have an impact on ocean currents and wave action which will have a direct impact on the Langebaan Lagoon and beach erosion.	These comments are noted, please refer to the responses to 8.1 above.
		CN Swart, Langebaan resident Letter (undated)	Any further expansion into the bay would disrupt sea currents which would lead to further beach erosion.	
8.3	Beach erosion – Cause of existing problems	P Fabricius, Saldanha Bay Forum Saldanha Bay Forum Meeting, 16/08/06	The stockpile extension is a critical issues as there is an existing perception that beach erosion is the result of previous reclamation [for the iron ore terminal].	These comments are noted. Shoreline stability, i.e. beach erosion, will be addressed as part of the marine hydrodynamics specialist study (see responses to 8.1 and 8.2 above).
		H Steenkamp, Vredenburg Agriculture FGM, 4/09/06	I'm sure the beach erosion at Langebaan is a result of the breakwater connecting the mainland to Marcus Island.	
		W Eksteen, BBBEE Forum FGM, 5/09/06	The problems with erosion at Langebaan started with the building of the breakwater to Marcus Island.	
8.4	Beach erosion – Possible solution	CN Swart, Langebaan resident Letter (undated)	Any expansion into the bay and the dredging of the shipping channels would lead to stronger currents in the shipping channels and further beach erosion. To stop this, the volume of water entering and exiting the bay must be reduced. The solution is to connect Rietbaai with the sea – this would reduce the deposition of sediment in the Langebaan Lagoon, which is already a problem. It would also reduce current acceleration in the bay and would limit beach erosion.	This is noted and will be passed on the marine hydrodynamics specialist to consider. Please also refer to the responses to 8.1, 8.2 and 8.3 above.
8.5	Beach erosion – Rehabilitation funds	G Clemitson, Saldanha Bay Trading cc FGM, 5/09/06	More ships are good for the economy, but it means more berths and dredging to accommodate those berths, which will lead to erosion, e.g. what is happening at Langebaan. What will the impact of this be 30 years from now? What guarantee will government make; will money be made available to address such future problems?	The potential impacts of the proposed expansion on marine hydrodynamics, including shoreline stability, will be assessed as part of the EIA (please refer to Section X of the DSR). The EIA will look at the cumulative impacts of the iron ore expansions. It will therefore also assess whether the West Coast National Park would be threatened by any particular development option. Options with impacts that are difficult to mitigate will be avoided. Transnet will identify impacts associated with particular options and dedicate the funding needed to implement the mitigation measures needed for the selected option.
		E Steyn, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	I am not against the development, but the planned dredging will create further erosion problems. You can't stop sea currents - if you deepen the bay, you create problems elsewhere; the sea will take back what you remove. Why has Portnet not done anything about it? By the time you know that there has been damage it is too late to do anything about it. Transnet know that their activities have caused the erosion problems at Langebaan but there's nothing they can do to fix it so they keep quiet.	
		M Halvorsen, Cape West Coast Biosphere Reserve Emailed letter, 1/09/06	When will the damage caused by the construction of the original iron ore facility be rectified? The RAMSAR registered wetland in the West Coast National Park is under serious threat because of these activities. The beach erosion at Langebaan is an example of how such a development should not be done. Will Transnet pay for rehabilitation or will this again be thrown before the taxpayers' door?	
		J Cloete, Vital Connection FGM, 5/09/06	30 years ago you could go to the beach right there were Portnet is building their new offices. Everywhere there is development right on the beach. The damage was done when the iron ore terminal was built. Many things happened but no money was put aside to address the problems. Langebaan used to have the most beautiful beach, now look at it! What's done is done but what about the future. Transnet has enough money but they don't want to take responsibility. We can't wait until 50 years from now until a trust is established to address damage; those funds should be made available now so that we have a guarantee!	
9. NOISE				
9.1	Noise impacts	A Wicht, Blue Bay Lodge Faxed comment form 31/08/06	Our concern is noise pollution. No satisfying research has been done or any solutions found for this aspect. We therefore require a guarantee that acceptable limits will be set for the Phase 2 upgrade.	This is noted. A specialist noise impact study will be conducted as part of the EIA (please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR for information on the proposed specialist studies The study will identify mitigation measures to ensure that noise levels are within acceptable limites. Transnet has ordered special brake trucks from the Netherlands, which will keep the trains under tension and greatly reduce the shunting noise. If this measure proves to be insufficient, other measures will be investigated. The issue of noise impact will be addressed in the EIA (please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR for information on the proposed specialist studies).
		J Wicht, Blouwaterbaai resident Email 30/08/06	Besides the dust issue my main complaint about the ore harbour has been the noise made by the shunting trains which, on an otherwise quiet night, rumble around loudly enough to wake me up as it starts, and keep me awake after that. The sounds are particularly irritating as the line of trucks is ±2 km long and is jerked forward 2 trucks at a time which results in a noise like thunder. I never received a reply on a letter I sent to Transnet suggesting that the whole unloading process should take place under cover, or at least behind some sort of sound barrier.	
		G van Zyl, West Coast Business Development Centre / Afrikaanse Sakekamer FGM, 4/09/06	Noise is already a problem, especially at the Salkor yard but also between Salkor and the harbour.	

#	Issue:	Raised by & how:	Comments made:	Responses:
10. PLANNING ISSUES				
10.1	General comments	G Clemitson, Saldanha Bay Trading cc FGM, 5/09/06	How can the community contribute to local decision-making processes without knowing what the bigger picture is? Strategic planning needs to happen; we as community must push for this!	This is noted.
10.2	IDP	D. Martheze, PGWC: Roads FGM, 24/08/06	How does the upgrade fit in with the West Coast District Municipality's IDP and its focus on tourism? It does not appear as if the Port's initiatives are being drawn into the IDP.	Although development has to take place, one has to avoid unnecessary damage to the environment and try not to impact negatively on other industries such as tourism. If properly mitigated Transnet's iron ore operations should not impact negatively on the West Coast's focus on tourism. The development option chosen should take into consideration this factor.
10.3	Port Master Plan	H Steenkamp, Vredenburg Agriculture FGM, 4/09/06	You should actually have an overarching meeting to discuss all of the Port's existing and planned developments and industrial activities, with all affected communities and the relevant Ministers, etc.. The local community can then have their say about the entire Port and Council will be able to take these into account when making decisions.	The Port Master Plan (refer to Section 4.3 of the DSR) should be seen in its proper context as a draft document, put together at port level, as a tool to guide thinking about harbour development. It is not a blue-print and only the beginning in a long-term planning process which involves the Transnet planning department and, ultimately, the Minister. Already substantial components of the Master Plan that have been presented have changed. There is, therefore, no preferred option for the proposed iron ore terminal expansion. The EIA will determine which option will be selected and the Master Plan will be adapted to reflect this option. Transnet will in due course conduct an overarching ('strategic') assessment of all its existing and planned developments and industrial activities at the port, which will address all cumulative impacts. It will also draw in all relevant stakeholders into this process, including the local municipal council.
		P. Fabricius, West Coast District Municipality FGM, 24/08/06	There is a concern that the selection of the preferred alternative stockpile extension would be driven by the Port's draft Master Plan, which shows the Alternative Option 1.	
		P. Hardcastle, DEA&DP FGM, 24/08/06	The Port's draft Master Plan must be made available so that the opportunity costs of the proposed Phase 2 Upgrade can be looked at i.t.o. the Port's planning.	
		H Steenkamp, Vredenburg Agriculture FGM, 4/09/06	Where does the oil and gas development fit in? You should address all of these future Port activities together. What about the ship building yard? You should indicate exactly where what is going to happen and show how the Port is zoned for each of these activity categories. Also, what about the possibility of an oil refinery at the Port in the future? It seems to be the logical next step for the Port.	
		V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	CapeNature requests that the Harbour Master Plan be included in the documentation available to IAPs in order to i) review this proposed EIA holistically, and ii) so we can make more informed decisions regarding the potential cumulative effects on the receiving environment. This in turn would aid in the prevention of future ecological compromise of other areas sooner rather than later and ensure the persistence of viable ecosystems. We are aware that the Master Plan is a working document that is subject to change and that it may need to be adapted to align with the IDP process e.g. align with the planning of the greater road network and tourism routes in the area.	
		A Kruger, Saldanha Bay & Langebaan Tourism Saldanha Bay Forum Meeting, 16/08/06	To what extent is the proposed project related to the Oil and Gas development?	
		G Clemitson, High Energy Watersport Saldanha Bay Forum Meeting, 16/08/06	Other developments are also planned in the port and surrounds; the expansion of the iron ore terminal is only a small part of future development.	
		A Carnegie, WESSA Western Cape Saldanha Bay Forum Meeting, 16/08/06	A Strategic Environmental Assessment must be conducted for the port, bay and other related areas.	
		W Eksteen, BBBEE Forum FGM, 5/09/06	What about the other plans for the harbour? Everything must be looked at holistically. What about the cumulative impact of the iron ore harbour and the oil and gas ventures? The impact of the iron ore facility is small in comparison with the bigger plans for the port. We're never told about these bigger plans – we're told about many small developments but never about the impact of the development of the whole port.	
J Cloete, Vital Connection FGM, 5/09/06	The Master Plan is left behind, it should be brought through the process along with the smaller developments. See, there is the dishonesty. Why don't they tell us beforehand that the causeway only has 15 years lifetime left? Why don't they tell us that they will need another breakwater to protect the new iron ore berth, so that we can take it into account?			
A Hein, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Councillor FGM, 5/09/06	Each development is being talked about separately. I believe everything should be handled together. The impact of the iron ore facility and the oil and gas development next door should be addressed together.			
10.4	Regional planning	G Clemitson, High Energy Watersport Saldanha Bay Forum Meeting, 16/08/06	There must be closer cooperation and communication between NPA and Council i.t.o. planning.	This is noted. Please refer to the response to 10.2 above.

#	Issue:	Raised by & how:	Comments made:	Responses:
11. RISK MANAGEMENT				
11.1	Oil spill risk	M Duckitt, Cape West Coast Biosphere Reserve Fax, 2/09/06	Oil spill procedures and application as in place in particular will need international best practice evaluation.	An incremental shipping risk study will be conducted as part of this EIA which will identify risks and recommend appropriate mitigation measures (please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR for information on the proposed specialist studies).
		N Steyn, Botanical Society Fax 31/08/06	The ever present danger of an oil spillage will become even greater due to the proposed large increase in shipping traffic. A severe oil spillage will be a major disaster as it will contaminate the entire bay and also the tidal Langebaan Lagoon, resulting in immeasurable harm to pristine holiday beaches, indigenous coastal 'fynbos', as well as marine resources and migratory birdlife from Northern Europe.	
11.2	Risk management plan	C van der Berg, Langebaan Ratepayers and Residents Association Faxed comment form, 1/09/06	The implementation of a researched, approved risk management plan, managed by a multi-disciplinary risk management team with a specific structure (who is responsible and who does what), controlled by national government with the necessary financial support and equipment for when a disaster happens in the harbour.	
12. SERVICES & INFRASTRUCTURE				
12.1	General comments	J Cillie, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Councillor FGM, 5/09/06	What impact will all this development have on municipal services? And how will it contribute? Will there be a contribution from Transnet for the municipality to adapt their services (water, electricity, sewerage)?	The provision of new service infrastructure will be investigated in the detailed design phase.
12.2	Access road	V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	The Scoping / EIA process must include information on the area through which the new access road will be constructed.	No new access roads will be constructed, but the existing access road to the iron ore facility will be upgraded (please refer to Section 2.2 of the DSR).
12.3	Energy supply	K Samie, DEAT FGM, 24/08/06	Will there be an increase in energy requirements?	There will be an increase in power requirements. New substations will be required and will be addressed in the EIA process.
		V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	How will the power supply be affected? Will upgrades to the power stations or power lines be necessary? Would this be included in this EIA or will a separate EIA be done for this purpose?	
12.4	Roads	W. Silbernagl, PGWC: Roads FGM, 24/08/06	A new road is planned between Saldanha and Langebaan and construction is due to begin next year. It is therefore very important to know what the Phase 2 Upgrade requirements are. The new road is intended to be a tourism route but provision must also be made for industry. More information is needed on the proposed Phase 2 road upgrades and the upgrade of the MR559 road bridge.	This is noted, please refer to Section 2.2 of the DSR for more information about the proposed road upgrade. Discussions with the Provincial Government and their roads planning consultants are ongoing to ensure that the proposals are integrated.
		I Britten, Stewart Scott International Comment form, 17/08/06	On behalf of the Provincial Government of the Western Cape; the future cross-section of the MR559 at the road-over-rail bridge near the iron ore facility will be a dual roadway. Provision is being made to complete the quarter link road on the western side, to widen the road-over-rail bridge and the north/east.	
		J Cillie, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Councillor FGM, 5/09/06	Which of the roads will be upgraded? How far will Transnet's responsibility stretch because there are many 'access roads'? Will the road from Saldanha carry more traffic? How does this fit in with the proposed new road between Saldanha and Langebaan?	
13. SHIPPING TRAFFIC				
13.1	General comments	V Bowie, CapeNature FGM, 24/08/06	What about the increase in shipping traffic?	An incremental shipping risk assessment will be conducted as part of the EIA (please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR for information on the proposed specialist studies).
13.2	Management responsibility	P Hardcastle, DEA&DP FGM, 24/08/06	Shipping traffic impacts would be difficult to mitigate, because Transnet cannot control what the ships do.	The Harbourmaster, who is responsible for shipping navigation in the Port, is employed by Transnet and would implement any shipping traffic mitigation measures.
		V Bowie & C Geland, CapeNature Emailed letter, 30/08/06	Larger ships are expected to enter the bay as a result of this proposed upgrading. We would like to know how they will be accommodated and who will be responsible to ensure that the necessary mitigation measures are implemented to reduce any impacts associated with larger ships.	
13.3	Shipping risks	J Cloete, Vital Connection FGM, 5/09/06	Having more ships in the port leads to greater risks for the port – oil spills, accidents, etc. There already were such incidents. I am very uncomfortable about these expansions because the possibility for damage is so big. If the port experiences significant damage it may as well close.	Please see response to 13.1 above.
14. SOCIO-ECONOMIC ISSUES				
14.1	General comments	G van Zyl, West Coast Business Development Centre / Afrikaanse Sakekamer FGM, 4/09/06	The Saldanha area has a very diverse community and people have different values and interests. Some don't care about pollution and only want job opportunities. Others care little for socio-economic benefits and is only interested in preventing pollution.	These comments are noted. These issues are also considered in the EIA process; people's values are recorded through their comments and are taken into account by the officials making the final decision.

#	Issue:	Raised by & how:	Comments made:	Responses:
		G van Zyl, West Coast Business Development Centre / Afrikaanse Sakekamer FGM, 4/09/06	I would say that social issues are almost more important than the natural environment because if you do not manage social issues properly the environment will also be badly impacted on.	
		W Arendse, White City / Diazville community leader FGM, 5/09/06	Transnet is a major roleplayer in the country's economy, but this comes with much [social responsibility]. We want to make a positive contribution. We would like to see that Transnet does a holistic social impact assessment that involves the community and all other roleplayers. In the words of Athol Fugard: "People are living there." What Transnet has done in the community may look good on paper but there are many shortcomings. It's not only about dust or erosion or the rich man's boat in the harbour. Transnet is a roleplayer in "a better life for all", which we strive for. We commit ourselves to a positive outcome. Saldanha is changing from a fishing village to a port city, and we would like Transnet to help us put Saldanha on the world map. Local and national economy will benefit from what can be achieved. We would like to speak freely and not feel intimidated by anyone.	
		G van Zyl, West Coast Business Development Centre / Afrikaanse Sakekamer FGM, 4/09/06	There has been so many instances where development in the Saldanha area was promised and predicted as a result of some industrial or other venture but it never transpired. People are therefore sceptical about development.	
		I Bester, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	There are always conditions set for all these developments, but it seems as if nothing is ever done to comply with them. A committee was set up in the time of Saldanha Steel, but since it became Mittal Steel the committee doesn't exist anymore.	
		H Steenkamp, Vredenburg Agriculture FGM, 4/09/06	Local people have become used to piecemeal development, every time with all sorts of promises that never transpire.	
		E Steyn, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	People feel as if they complain and complain but nothing ever happens. It's not as if we are against development, it's just that it feels as if nothing is done about our complaints.	
		I Bester, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	People stream to the West Coast with these venture to come and make money and do not really care about the environment. In hindsight, nobody in Saldanha will say that it was a good idea to bring Saldanha Steel and Namakwa Sands here. What they say will happen is always very different from what eventually does happen.	
		I Bester, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	The community is sceptical about the plans; they do not trust the large companies because they have shown that they can't be trusted.	
		W Eksteen, BBBEE Forum FGM, 5/09/06	This is of great concern to Saldanha. The large industries come here but leave as soon as they are done and go live elsewhere. There is no financial injection into Saldanha! I don't want to live elsewhere, be we are left behind in spite of all the local industrial development. We suffer all the negative impacts but those that bring it here don't care because they don't live here. The average local person is stuck in their circumstances – they can't leave and they can't improve their lives!	
		W Arendse, White City / Diazville community leader FGM, 5/09/06	We are still the losers; we are not included in decisions about the economic growth of our area (Saldanha). Our children will one day point their fingers at us and say that we contributed to the loss of Saldanha's heritage. We need to take control and become part of the decision-making process – the community is becoming smarter on a daily basis. There are policies in place but we don't know how to implement them. We don't want handouts, we want monuments. We want to be able to show visitors the things that the Port contributed to the community, e.g. crèches, schools, sport facilities, etc. Things that makes sense to visitors and means something to the community.	
		G Clemitson, Saldanha Bay Trading cc FGM, 5/09/06	We should not forget people from other nearby settlements (e.g. Hopefield). My concern is that people from different areas have their own interests. The community does not stand together – what we need is a truly representative body that can press the entire community's issues with the politicians.	

#	Issue:	Raised by & how:	Comments made:	Responses:
		J Cloete, Vital Connection FGM, 5/09/06	The only benefit of this project would be on Transnet's balance sheet! It is difficult to see any possible benefits for local communities. The money always land up in somebody else's pocket and they spend it elsewhere. It is easy for people to come here and say things, but then they leave again and we who live here are left behind and nothing happens. It is the reality that things happen on the West Coast but the local people don't see any benefits. They are lying to us again. The most important point of today's discussion is that if anybody wants to come in from outside to develop in the area they must give us money first so that we can address all the [socio-economic] issues. Then they can go ahead.	The project makes possible the increase of iron ore exports, on which many jobs and communities depend. Any development of this nature has both positive and negative socio-economic impacts. The trick is to maximise the positive and minimise the negative. The EIA will identify any such negative impacts to ensure that effective mitigatory measures are set in place.
14.2	Crime	H Steenkamp, Vredenburg Agriculture FGM, 4/09/06	There are plans for a large new police station for Vredenburg and Saldanha, but there is a problem with funds and there are all kinds of delays. There is however an awareness of crime and an increase in crime and that measures are needed to address the problem.	These comments are noted. Please note that a specialist social impact assessment will be conducted as part of this EIA (please refer to Section 6.3 of the DSR for information on the proposed specialist studies). The study will assess all of the potential social impacts of the proposed Phase 2 expansion project identified during the Scoping phase and will identify and recommend appropriate mitigation measures to minimise any negative impacts and enhance potential benefits. These issues have been passed on the social specialist for consideration in the study.
		E Boonzaaier, Vredenburg Ambulance Service FTM, 5/09/06	Crime has tripled in the last decade since Saldanha Steel was built. This has placed tremendous pressure on existing infrastructure. There is something we haven't mentioned: how many people have lost loved ones in this time? We are at a point of almost not being able to cope anymore; I hope this does not get worse with all these new developments.	
		J Cillie, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Councillor FGM, 5/09/06	14 years ago I could leave my car outside with everything in it. Today I have to lock it up in a garage and it still isn't safe! It must be accepted that all economic development bring and element of crime and unemployment.	
14.3	Fishing industry	W Arendse, White City / Diazville community leader FGM, 5/09/06	How will the fishing community be affected by the increase in shipping traffic? We had a incident with a loss of the Tamara (luckily no lives were lost). How will the small fisherman who's been fishing for years be accommodated?	
		M Nell, WPVV Saldanha FGM, 5/09/06	As soon as you do any blasting in the marine environment, all of the fish disappear. Fishing is the livelihood of many local people.	
14.4	Housing	A Talmakkies, Saldanha Business Owner Comment form, 16/08/06	If you employ workers from outside the area you must provide housing.	
		J Cloete, Vital Connection FGM, 5/09/06	It's not just about building houses; industrial players should make funds available to the local municipality for housing.	
		S Biko, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Councillor FGM, 5/09/06	Transnet must look after their workers by subsidising their housing or by paying decent salaries that would allow workers to afford housing.	
14.5	Influx of work seekers	I Bester, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	The problem is the people that come into the area after potential job opportunities. This creates problems for the municipality and the police services who are not kept informed of the increase in population.	
		J van Litzenborgh, SAPS Vredenburg FGM, 4/09/06	How many temporary and permanent job opportunities will be created? We have to know beforehand so that we can make sure we are prepared for the growth in population. This has huge impact on crime – more people means more crime – and it is so much worse when unemployment is a factor. In the last few years, crime against property had increased but crime against persons not so much. This results from unemployment. Currently we are still coping, but if there is an influx of people we will have problems.	
		K Heynes, Women's Network FGM, 5/09/06	If people from outside area come after job opportunities, how will we deal with the increase in crime? There is already a shortage – in Diazville and White City we easily wait for five or six hours for a police car.	
		W Arendse, White City / Diazville community leader FGM, 5/09/06	Informal settlements are growing hugely in the area (Middelpos). You can't stop it, there is a huge influx of people. Contractors come in with their workers and when they leave, they leave their workers behind, which leads to massive social problems.	
		J Cillie, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Councillor FGM, 5/09/06	People hear that there is development in Saldanha and they come here in masses in hope of job opportunities. This leads to higher unemployment. Any economic development must be measured against social degradation.	
14.6	Job creation	A Talmakkies, Saldanha Business Owner Comment form, 16/08/06	Please give the local disadvantaged communities a chance before you go look for workers/services from outside the area. Our children finish school but there is no money for further study and with nothing to do they become involved in drugs and crime. Please provide training for our people.	Transnet estimates that 50-70% of the construction labour force will be recruited locally and the remainder of the labour will generally come from outside the area, should higher skills categories not be readily available in the local communities. Local job opportunities should therefore be in the region of ±300.

#	Issue:	Raised by & how:	Comments made:	Responses:
		C van der Berg, Langebaan Ratepayers and Residents Association Faxed comment form, 1/09/06	Our association realises that the Phase 2 expansion, which entails a 244.7% increase in iron ore export, was a high level political and economic decision in national interest. It will result in an economic injection in the region with a ripple effect for businesses and job creation to help reduce poverty. We support this decision and welcome the proposed expansion on condition that the planning, execution and management of the facility is managed well and take account of human and animal health, environmental, air and marine pollution, as well as welfare, socio-economic and ecological (terrestrial, marine and botanical) problems. Decisions must therefore be well researched and it is imperative that the best available international practices are implemented. International and national specialists must be used to address the relevant issues. The example of the Richards Bay harbour development should be used to avoid similar mistakes.	Strict protocols will apply to the secondment of labour from outside of the area, "local" being defined as any person of South African citizenship who resides within a 100km radius of the project site. Contractors will be expected to provide on-the-job training to local labour in order to up-grade existing skills. Meetings have been held with the Department of Labour in Vredenburg and with local community officials to explain the processes and to alert these institutions to employment opportunities that will come about. It is anticipated that a database will be developed and a process put in place to facilitate the recruitment of local labour by the Contractors. Transnet policy states that all local labour requirements can only be sourced through the Department of Labour.
		H Steenkamp, Vredenburg Agriculture FGM, 4/09/06	The question is: who will jobs be created for? For anyone who happens to be in the area or only for local residents? You must define clearly who will benefit from job opportunities.	
		K Blaauw, Cape Global FGM, 4/09/06	The human resources company that I am involved with inspects people's ID books to ensure that they are at least South African. It should be made part of the tender criteria that tenderers should have a minimum level of local content, so that job opportunities and economic benefits go to local people.	
		I Bester, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	So many promises were made about the Saldanha Steel project and that only local people would benefit from job opportunities, but how many local people are actually employed there – very few! I would define 'local' as those who have lived in our municipal area for at least the last 10 years.	
		E Steyn, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	By much has Transnet's employment increased or decreased since the iron harbour was established here? We have high unemployment in the area. When job opportunities come up, people must first look to the local unemployed before jobs are created for those people who come into the area after potential opportunities.	
		A Kruger, Saldanha Bay & Langebaan Tourism Saldanha Bay Forum Meeting, 16/08/06	Previous developments have made empty promises of local job opportunities. Are programmes in place to identify labour requirements and meet opportunities?	
		J Cloete, Vital Connection FGM, 5/09/06	The perception of possible job opportunities will result in thousands of people coming into the area and they don't leave again. This has a major impact on services, crime, etc.	
		K Heynes, Women's Network FGM, 5/09/06	It is also about our children! Our matriculants go to the cities for training, but when they're ready there are no local work opportunities. Die larger companies from outside the area get all the benefits. Some small local companies get benefits but they're still the guys that go home last with the least money in their pockets.	
		W Eksteen, BBBEE Forum FGM, 5/09/06	I'm concerned because it looks like technical work with few opportunities for unskilled people.	
		H Fatuse, Saldanha business owner Comment form, 16/08/06	I support the project because it will provide jobs for small emerging businesses in the West Coast and jobs for those who are unemployed.	
		M Nell, WPVV Saldanha FGM, 5/09/06	As soon as you do any blasting in the marine environment, all of the fish disappear. Fishing is the livelihood of many local people. You may be creating alternative livelihoods for these local people but then you must make sure that they are real opportunities.	

#	Issue:	Raised by & how:	Comments made:	Responses:
		A Hein, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Councillor FGM, 5/09/06	The large corporations like Saldanha Steel and Transnet are nightmares. They promise thousands of job opportunities but then employ 80% of their employees from outside the area and local people sit without jobs. They say they can't find local people with skills, but they don't want to appoint local people and then they say it is because local people don't want to work. Transnet should do a needs analysis beforehand. They must look at what job opportunities will be created and pass the information on to the local government and relevant organisations. The Workforces and Globals of the world also bring people in from outside – they say they bring training etc. but they lie because they don't have the capacity to train. Companies must establish themselves what they will need so that local underdeveloped people can prepare themselves. How long will it be until work starts and will Transnet be able to say what kind of workers they will need? They don't need to identify people themselves, they only need to provide the information to the municipality; we know who to contact and how to get hold of them.	
		S Biko, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality Councillor FGM, 5/09/06	We have a problem with labour brokers that appoint subcontractors who abuse the workers, they don't provide pensions or other benefits. They appoint people but does not provide for workers' futures. Workers are used like cheap labour. Companies should always work through the municipality so that they are kept informed about when companies will need workers and what skills they will need. Along with skills training, lifeskills training is important because there are many good people that do not have good educations.	
		M Nell, WPVV Saldanha FGM, 5/09/06	In terms of your tender forms, they are usually so complicated! Can they not be simplified and done in Afrikaans? Otherwise local people are immediately at a disadvantage.	The contracts and related documents are all prepared in English. It would be unmanageable if these documents were to be in two or more of our South African official languages. Unfortunately the documents would probably be equally complicated in formal Afrikaans and simplifying the wording may result in different interpretations. Tenderers who have difficulty with the language used in the tender documents should get the advice of local people who are suitably qualified to advise them.
14.7	Sense of place & community	G van Zyl, West Coast Business Development Centre / Afrikaanse Sakekamer FGM, 4/09/06	The local community is quite isolated and do not like outsiders which they call 'inkommers' – the older generation do not even like tourists coming into the area. The area is very rural and the community very Afrikaans. It causes strife when 'inkommers' cannot understand Afrikaans and everyone must therefore speak English – there is a general resistance against speaking English.	These comments are noted. Please refer to the response to 14.2 – 14.5 above. Afrikaans versions of key EIA documents (Executive Summaries, etc.) will be provided in Afrikaans. All meetings held as part of the public consultation process are conducted in both English and Afrikaans, depending on the attendees' requirements.
		K Blaauw, Cape Global FGM, 4/09/06	I am an 'inkommer' and I was made to feel very welcome. The community is close-knit because we are interested in and care about each other.	
		I Bester, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	Saldanha is no longer a sleepy fishing village, it is seen as an industrial town. Even Paternoster has lost its traditional cultural character.	
		I Bester, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	Saldanha used to be a close-knit community; it's not like that anymore. There is lots of apathy – people will complain but they do not want to get involved.	
		E Steyn, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	Vredenburg/Saldanha is a difficult community – if you come from elsewhere you are not easily accepted and you are called an 'inkommer'. Things have changed because many people come into the area temporarily and before they can become part of the community they leave again – this is as a result of all the industrial ventures.	
		J van Litzendorgh, SAPS Vredenburg FGM, 4/09/06	I'm relatively new to the area. I wasn't made to feel very welcome in the beginning, but that was probably for more political reasons. I think that although there is a measure of apathy in the community, if there is a serious problem they will stand together.	
14.8	Social infrastructure	G van Zyl, West Coast Business Development Centre / Afrikaanse Sakekamer FGM, 4/09/06	Local schools are all full because all these 'inkommers' want to send their kids to the best local Model C schools.	
		H Steenkamp, Vredenburg Agriculture FGM, 4/09/06	All the local schools are very full. Years ago they predicted that 3 high schools and 5 primary schools would be required in the 1990s. Only the West Coast school was established since then; there is therefore definitely a need for more schools.	
		K Blaauw, Cape Global FGM, 4/09/06	There is also a lack of fire fighting services – whenever there is a fire crisis the military's fire fighting services are called in.	

#	Issue:	Raised by & how:	Comments made:	Responses:
		E Steyn, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	There are good schools in the area but they are too full. A new school is being built but it will cater for the needs of a specific group within the community. There are plans for more schools. Another problem is public transport and a competitive local taxi industry. Many RDP houses have been built and more are planned. Houses in Vredenburg and Langebaan are very expensive – it is not cheap to live here. Renting is also expensive and it is difficult for young people starting out. Transnet and Namakwa Sands have sold all their houses and do not provide housing for their employees anymore. We have adequate medical infrastructure. There hasn't really been a bloom period in the area's economy and so far Vredenburg is still able to provide for most people's needs.	
		I Bester, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	The police do not have adequate facilities. Their offices are in an old warehouse that and they're paying a fortune in rent. They definitely need better facilities to be able to do their job properly.	
		W Eksteen, BBBEE Forum FGM, 5/09/06	There are no private schools in Saldanha, but two in Langebaan, because that's where the big shots of Saldanha's industries live. The situation in Saldanha does not only justify better schools but also a university! But there isn't even enough land available for housing, where would these go? The land that is available is so expensive that it is better for people to go live in Langebaan; and you can't blame them!	
		G Clemitson, Saldanha Bay Trading cc FGM, 5/09/06	There is a sewage infrastructure problem in Langebaan. There is a lack of adequate planning – the responsible people sit in Vredenburg and don't know or don't care about the problem in Langebaan. The person responsible for expansion of the Langebaan sewage system has not done his job. Is this a funding problem? No, the money is available – each developer has to contribute funds for infrastructure. This model should be used in the region. Can we not get each industrial player to contribute to a fund used for social infrastructure like schools, etc? There should be constant feed into such a fund.	
		J Cloete, Vital Connection FGM, 5/09/06	The problem is also that if you do want to do some social upliftment, it takes years to get the appropriate approvals to get access to available funds! Money comes in slowly (from PetroSA, etc.) but when it is needed you can't access it!	
14.9	Tourism	E Steyn, Saldanha Bay Local Municipality FGM, 4/09/06	Saldanha has stagnated in terms of development. It used to be a tourism town, now it has become an industrial town and people are leaving the area. Langebaan is now becoming a development node – you can't market Saldanha as a tourist destination anymore.	
		M Halvorsen, Cape West Coast Biosphere Reserve Emailed letter, 1/09/06	The development can destroy a very important tourism area. Incidents such as what recently happened in the Southern Cape, at Groot Brakrivier and Kaaimans Pass, proves that wrong human decisions can have serious environmental and economic consequences.	
		N Steyn, Botanical Society Fax 31/08/06	The harbour and iron ore dumps are already an eyesore in an area which prides itself as a top tourist destination. Any additional encroachment on into the bay through enlargement of the ship-loading area as well as several additional stockpile areas will have a further negative visual impact.	
14.10	Unemployment	G van Zyl, West Coast Business Development Centre / Afrikaanse Sakekamer FGM, 4/09/06	People will stream into the area because of prospective job opportunities which will lead to higher unemployment. There is already a problem with many people from outside the area coming in to find work. People from the Transkei are brought in on buses and there are many people from other African countries. This increases unemployment also among the local people and leads to other social problems such as crime.	
		K Blaauw, Cape Global FGM, 4/09/06	Unemployment in turn leads to many other social problems, e.g. homelessness and street children.	
14.11	Women	K Heynes, Women's Network FGM, 5/09/06	There is much talk of development but where do women fit in? There are many women in the area who are willing and skilled but there are no opportunities. Only about 10% of Saldanha Steel's employees are women. There's talk of benefits for women but we don't see any of it.	
		M Nell, WPVV Saldanha FGM, 5/09/06	Who will benefit? Is there plan to provide opportunities to unskilled / unschooled people and especially for women? There are many women in the area that are willing and skilled; all they need is encouragement and opportunities.	

#	Issue:	Raised by & how:	Comments made:	Responses:
15.	VISUAL			
15.1	Visual impact	N Steyn, Botanical Society Fax 31/08/06	The harbour and iron ore dumps are already an eyesore in an area which prides itself as a top tourist destination. Any additional encroachment on into the bay through enlargement of the ship-loading area as well as several additional stockpile areas will have a further negative visual impact.	These comments are noted. Please note that a specialist visual impact assessment will be conducted as part of the EIA which will identify and assess the potential visual impacts of the proposed Phase 2 expansion project and recommend appropriate mitigation measures.
		J Matthee, Blouwaterbaai homeowner Email, 13/08/06	The whole iron ore harbour has a visual impact on us.	